

Meeting Transcript 1

**Miami City Commission
November 18, 2021
Afternoon Session**

Transcript of excerpt of video recording available at:
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=w1qOdmCteM8>

**PLAINTIFFS' TRIAL
EXHIBIT**

P1

1:22-cv-24066-KMM

exhibitster.com

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Russell: Alright, we are ready to redistrict this city, Mr. De Grandy. Let's
2 draw the lines. This is a discussion item on redistricting of the city, based on the new census
3 data. The city has hired Mr. De Grandy to help us through this process, and he's going to be
4 reporting to us and looking for direction from this body. The floor is yours, Mr. De Grandy.

5 Mr. De Grandy: Thank you and for your IT folks, if they could put up the presentation.
6 And while they're doing that, Commissioner Reyes, thank you for the memo on the dress code, I
7 followed it as it —

8 Commissioner Reyes: That's and I should look the same way.

9 Mr. De Grandy: There we go.

10 Commissioner Reyes: We're playing tonight with the same band.

11 Mr. De Grandy: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners, good afternoon. For the record, my name
12 is Miguel De Grandy, my address is 701 Brickell Avenue. And along with Mr. Steve Cody, we
13 serve as your redistricting consultants. Now, together we've had the pleasure of developing the
14 city's redistricting plan during the 2000 and 2010 cycle. This is our third rodeo, and as you
15 know, last week I provided you with an initial report which contains much of the information
16 that we will discuss today. In this presentation, I'm not going to bore you with case law, etcetera
17 that we cited in the report. Instead, the purpose of the presentation is to recap some basic
18 principles and seek policy guidance from you on several issues.

19 Now, to be clear, our job as consultants is not to make policy decisions. Our job is to try
20 to reflect this commission's policies and directives as best we can in a constitutionally compliant
21 district plan. Now as we explained in our initial report, there are often competing principles in
22 crafting a redistricting plan, and so it is seldom possible to reflect all the policy guidance you
23 may provide us, but we will do our best to prepare and present a plan that accomplishes the goals

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 that you have set out. First, let's start with the basics, next slide.

2 The first step in crafting a district plan is to determine the ideal population for each
3 district. In the last decade, the city's population grew by 42,752 residents or 10.7% according to
4 the census. Also according to the census, the city's population is now 442,241. Now, of course,
5 this is just a snapshot in time, but it the constitutionally accepted number by which to develop a
6 new district plan. However, the growth has not been uniform across the districts. In order to
7 determine whether the district populations still meet acceptable constitutional parameters, we
8 must start the analysis by calculating the ideal population for a district based on the new census
9 data. Next slide.

10 Determining the ideal population is simple calculator, taking the total population dividing
11 it by the number of districts, and that's 88,448. Next slide. If you break the city down by
12 districts, you see that the current District 1 has a population north of 80,000. District 2 has the
13 highest population at almost 117,000. District 3 has the lowest population at 79 and change.
14 District 1's population is north of 81,000. And finally, District 5's population is 83,000 and
15 change. As you can see, every district deviates from the ideal population. Next slide. The
16 deviation may be lower or higher as the case may be in the current plan, where the most
17 populated district has over 28,000 citizens and the lowest with under 9,000 residents. Now, with
18 this information, we can determine if the plan is malapportioned by now calculating the overall
19 deviation. Next slide.

20 Commissioner Russell: Could you go back one slide please? Just for a second.

21 Mr. De Grandy: Sure. If you want, I'll go back afterwards, as long as you want.

22 Commissioner Russell: I was just trying to do quick math in my head on the last slide, not
23 this one, but the one just before with the actual deviation numbers. Got it, thank you.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Mr. De Grandy: Okay. Now, the overall deviation is a delta between the highest and the
2 lowest population district, and is expressed in terms of percentages. Next slide. As you can see,
3 District 2 has a population of slightly over 32% the ideal. District 3 has a population slightly
4 under 10% of the ideal. The overall population is then calculated by adding the highest and
5 lowest percentage, which in the city's plan is slightly over 42% overall deviation. Now, unlike
6 for congressional plans, as I explained in the report that I gave you, which requires virtual
7 mathematical certainty because it flows from one provision to the constitution.

8 Federal courts have provided more leeway in crafting a district plan. Federal case law
9 informs that for state and local plans, one has to achieve substantial equality. Next slide. This
10 basically has come to mean, based on the case law, the district plans for local governments may
11 not exceed an overall deviation of 10%. Next slide. Therefore, it's easy to determine that at 42%
12 overall deviation, the current plan is malapportioned and cannot be used in subsequent elections.
13 Next slide.

14 The challenge is to equalize the population among the districts, which basically requires a
15 depopulation of District 2 and a methodology to ripple that population into the other four
16 districts. Sir?

17 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I have a question. The total deviation is for the whole
18 municipal government, for the whole city, not per district? The 10% that's allowed for local
19 governments?

20 Mr. De Grandy: 10% meaning, for example, if we're crafting —

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: But the 10% deviation, is it within a district or within
22 the entire city?

23 Mr. De Grandy: Within the entire city. So for example, if we're creating a new district

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 plan and you tell me, go ahead and go with substantial equality as opposed to mathematical
2 equality, which I would recommend. Then I could, for example, under populate a district by 3.5,
3 4% and overpopulate a district by 5.5, 6%.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: You have that leeway, right —

5 Mr. De Grandy: But it's going to have to stay within 10.

6 Commissioner Reyes: That means that a district could be a, instead of being let's say the
7 all 88,000 voters —

8 Mr. De Grandy: It would be 87 something.

9 Commissioner Reyes: It would be 87 something, 85 something, and it all depends what
10 are the priorities, what they maintain, the integrity of the district, blah, blah, blah. Okay.

11 Mr. De Grandy: Right, right, and some of this I will cover in my presentation, if you'll
12 allow me a few minutes just to finish.

13 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I'm sorry, how much, what's a maximum deviation
14 you can have per district?

15 Mr. De Grandy: It's not calculated per district. It's calculated per plan. The overall
16 deviation of the plan.

17 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: But what's your thinking, and how are you going to go
18 down the line? In other words, you'll be okay. You guys will be okay. We have one district has
19 84 and one that has 92 for example.

20 Mr. De Grandy: If that's over 10%, I'm not okay. If it's under 10, if one is 87 something,
21 one is 89 something, and it's within 10%, that's acceptable.

22 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Okay.

23 Mr. De Grandy: Okay, again, the challenge is to equalize the populations. And again, the

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 district populations can deviate by 10%, they do not have to be exactly equal. Apart from the
2 constitutional requirement above, the requirement excuse me to achieve substantial equality of
3 population among the districts, let's briefly address other legal principles governing a
4 redistricting process. Next slide.

5 The Voting Rights Act of 1965 prohibits practices or procedures that discriminate on the
6 basis of race, color, or a membership in one of the language minority groups. Now, the Act has
7 been applied in the context of redistricting to prohibit practices that result in dissolution of the
8 minorities group voting strength or their ability to elect candidates of choice. In order to
9 determine whether the Voting Rights Act is implicated in a redistricting process, one must first
10 determine whether the minority group meets certain thresholds under the case of Thornburg
11 versus Gingles. Next slide.

12 First the majority group, minority group, excuse me, must be large enough and compact
13 to comprise a majority in a single member district. Second, minority voters must be politically
14 cohesive. And that means they generally coalesce around the same candidates or issues in
15 elections. And third, the majority must usually vote as a bloc to thwart the election of the
16 minority-preferred candidate. Now, since we engaged, we have been conducting an analysis to
17 determine the applicability, and thus we performed a deep dive into the last decade of elections
18 to determine voting patterns in the city. And for example, we analyzed the DeSantis versus
19 Gillum election. We then looked at precincts that were majority Black to see how that
20 community voted. And then we analyzed majority white districts. Next slide.

21 We have determined that as in the last cycle, there is still significant voter polarization in
22 the city, and thus the Voting Rights Act must be factored into this process. What that means is
23 that we can consider race as one of several factors that we will be conscious of in crafting a plan.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Now as you read in our initial report, there are also competing principles in this regard. For
2 example, the case of Shaw versus Reno, the United States Supreme Court held that a plan whose
3 prime directive is creating districts based on race, violates the constitution. And thus, reconciling
4 these competing principles, it could be said that in crafting a district plan, one can be race-
5 conscious, but not race-driven. In other words, racial consideration may be one of a menu of
6 factors that one considers in developing a plan, but cannot be the overriding factor. Next slide.

7 So the prime directives are compliance with the Constitution, and the Voting Rights Act.
8 Now, what other considerations are part of that menu I discussed in developing a plan that
9 should also be used. And that leads us to a discussion of traditional redistricting principles. Next
10 slide. Now, I've listed in the report and here on this slide, some of the most commonly utilized
11 criteria, but the commission can also direct the use of any criteria that furthers a rational or
12 important city interest, so long as it does not result in minority voter dilution or a race-driven
13 plan. Now, keep in mind that these criteria can also be competing and irreconcilable. And that's
14 why we will be asking the commission at the end of this presentation for direction as to A, what
15 criteria to use, and B, what criteria to emphasize more than others.

16 Let me give me an example. Let's go to slide 16, I believe, the next slide. Emphasizing
17 compactness, for example, may not allow us in the plan as it's drawn, to maintain the core of
18 existing districts. If the core of existing districts is important to you, then compactness is not one
19 that I'm going to emphasize. Also, we need to know whether you wish to achieve mathematical
20 equality, we can do that, or substantial equality of population, and as we discussed briefly,
21 substantial equality gives me more flexibility to draw a plan. And finally, we need policy
22 direction on the timing of public hearings. Next slide.

23 We have two significant issues that affect our timeline. Now first, census data, as you

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 know, was supposed to be released in April of this year, it was not published until the end of
2 September, so we're behind the curve. Additionally, we've been in conversations with the
3 county's department of elections. The department is in the process of re-precincting the county in
4 time for the upcoming 2022 elections. Supervisor Christina White has requested that we have the
5 city's plan adopted by the end of February 2022 so she can incorporate that in her re-precincting
6 process. Now, let stop there for a second, and tell you, that's not an etched in stone, but it does
7 come at a cost to the city.

8 What Ms. White has told me basically is if I can incorporate your plan into our re-
9 precincting process, it comes at no cost to the city. If the city redistricts after they re-precinct,
10 then they may have to redo the precincts for the city, they may have to issue new voter cards,
11 postage, etcetera, and that cost will be borne by the city. The county will not cover it. Now, in
12 past cycles, talking again about public meetings, the city did hold public meetings prior to the
13 development of the plan. That was of course when we got timely census data. But the delay in
14 the release of the census data may impact our ability to meet the department of elections
15 timeline, and will delay the process.

16 Several jurisdictions, including our state legislature, have opted not to hold public
17 hearings prior to developing another plan as a result of the delay in the census data. Moreover,
18 the public will, never the less, have an opportunity to comment when a plan is presented in a
19 public hearing. And if those comments result in this commission direction to make modifications
20 to the plan, we will do so, and we will present a final plan in subsequent public hearing. Again, I
21 would recommend that we have the public hearings when the plan is presented.

22 And I could tell you, based on our experience last two decades, the last two cycles, that
23 when we held these public meetings, number 1, almost no one showed up, because there was

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 nothing to see, and number 2, the first or second or third question that I got is why am I here,
2 what do you have to show me. And what I would say is well we're here to get input from you
3 and the answer would, input on what, you're not showing me anything. So I think the best time
4 for the public to interact is when they have a draft plan to review and comment on. Now, with
5 that commissioners, we look forward to your policy discussion and guidance, and Mr. Cody and
6 I are here to answer any questions you may have.

7 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Mr. De Grandy, you said there would be a cost to the
8 city if we redistrict after they re-precinct? And did they express to you what that cost would be?

9 Mr. De Grandy: I actually asked Ms. White, and Ms. White, and she — I called her in the
10 morning, she had a busy day, she answered my call at 5:00, she was already in her car. She said I
11 can't give you a cost. I asked for a ballpark, I can't give you a ballpark, but basically, you can
12 quantify the postage for sending new voter cards to all residents of the city, the printing costs for
13 the cards, and their internal work in doing the re-precincting.

14 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: What's the feasibility of you having a plan by
15 February of '22, you said? That's four months away. What's the feasibility of us having or you
16 presenting us with an actual plan before that date?

17 Mr. De Grandy: If you provide me policy direction today, and that policy direction
18 includes, we're going to defer the public hearings until the plan is presented. We can get you a
19 plan by February of 2022.

20 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: You told us that these public hearings are worthless if
21 you don't have an actual map or an actual plan, so until — we can't have the public hearings
22 until you have an actual map. And then how many public hearings, you do one in every district, I
23 would take it. So it's five?

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Mr. De Grandy: I would suggest we have one here.

2 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right here. One total hearing?

3 Mr. De Grandy: Yes. And then have another one if there are any changes that are directed
4 by the commission.

5 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Is a plan more legally binding if we have more public
6 hearings or is it okay if we just do one public hearing?

7 Mr. De Grandy: No, there is no constitutional requirement to have any public hearings.

8 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: But in other cases that you've dealt with because
9 you're an expert in this. Have you had problems when you don't have public hearings?

10 Mr. De Grandy: Not from a legal perspective, no.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Okay.

12 Mr. De Grandy: And as I said, the first time I did redistricting, I was a member of the
13 legislature and we traveled and did 26 public hearings. And there, we had some draft plans to
14 present to the community and the community did have comments based on that plan. But those
15 were draft plans, those were public hearings based on draft plans.

16 Commissioner Carollo: And by the way, the public hearings don't have to be here, if they
17 could be a more centrally located location.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right, that's what I'm saying.

19 Commissioner Carollo: For the whole city, it could be in the MRC.

20 Commissioner Russell: It could be where you want.

21 Commissioner Carollo: Or in the middle of the city, or anywhere else.

22 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Central park or everything else. But I just have a
23 quick, I have one final question, that's all. An answer by the numbers you presented, all the

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 voters would come from Commissioner, well District 2, correct?

2 Commissioner Carollo: Not necessarily. There's two ways we could go into it.

3 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah. Still, you have to take about 28,000 from him,
4 right?

5 Mr. De Grandy: Yes. The answer to your question is to equalize population—

6 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: The lines could change —

7 Mr. De Grandy: — you have to move 28,000 citizens —

8 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: — to the other districts.

9 Mr. De Grandy: — and ripple them up in four districts. That will mean that the
10 boundaries of every district will be modified.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: But you also have to protect the core constituencies of
12 each district, correct?

13 Mr. De Grandy: If that's what you direct me, that's what I do.

14 Commissioner Reyes: Absolutely.

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right, so you protect the core constituencies, however
16 we define that term, of those districts, and then you add, and most of that will be added from
17 Commissioner Russell's district, right, because he comes around every district.

18 Mr. De Grandy: Well, I want to be clear, Commissioner Russell's district will be
19 depopulated, but the population that may end up in your district, may come from another
20 commissioner's district because I have to ripple from one district to another.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: The proximity of course, but I'm sorry, it leads to
22 another question. I also, a slide that we skipped through, but I saw it here, was that there is a
23 need to protect an African American district. Is that correct?

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Mr. De Grandy: There is —

2 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: As long as they're compact?

3 Mr. De Grandy: Let me be clear because the record is very important.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yes sir.

5 Mr. De Grandy: For any future actions.

6 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's why I'm asking, I'm trying to ask you the right
7 way.

8 Mr. De Grandy: The goal is to make sure that we do not dilute the voting strength of a
9 voting community.

10 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Of a minority community, African American. But you
11 can dilute, hypothetically, to be clear, hypothetically, a white population, is not a minority group,
12 correct?

13 Mr. De Grandy: White, non-Hispanic, is not a protected class under the Voting Rights
14 Act.

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Correct, correct, so you in essence, could be
16 eliminating what we call here in Miami, in practical terms, an Anglo, right, the term that we use
17 here, seat, potentially.

18 Mr. De Grandy: Well, Commissioner, I will tell you, interesting fun fact, there is no
19 Anglo district, District 2 is 52% Hispanic.

20 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I know, that's what I was getting to. I know the
21 percentage, but it's also Coconut Grove center. As an example.

22 Commissioner Carollo: If I could interject something because by law we have to make
23 the districts on population, but that's not the reality of it. The reality of it, let me give it to you,

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 so you can see the reality. The reality is on those that vote. And who are the ones that least vote,
2 the less income because they are not US citizens. And the bulk of that falls on the Hispanic
3 community.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Sure, I was getting at.

5 Commissioner Carollo: Some in the Haitian community.

6 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's what I was getting at.

7 Commissioner Carollo: Let me give you the real numbers. In District 1, you have the
8 second lowest amount of voters of all the districts, 34,416. District 2, 62,198, by far the most.

9 Commissioner Russell: Registered or active?

10 Commissioner Carollo: Registered. District 3, the lowest of all of them, 32,825. District
11 4, 41,908, District 5, 46,884. We have to work this out in a way that it meets the criteria of the
12 law that you more or less have to have the same amount of population in this, in each district,
13 with the deviations that he mentioned. But we also have to work it in a way that the balance is
14 not really shifted. And let's go back to —

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Let me just finish thoughts because I'm going to lose
16 my train of thought. It's very quick. We have to do it of voting age population, is what the law
17 requires us to do. But there is a reality that Commissioner Carollo mentions which is that the
18 registration numbers and the under reporting, because the census doesn't tell you, but a lot of
19 people who are of age, but are not residents or not citizens, who don't report, don't fill out the
20 census because they're afraid, so it's not really a real representation.

21 Putting that aside, I was trying to get to the point that in District 2, there's over voting,
22 turnout matters too right, in Coconut Grove for example. There's a much higher turnout in
23 Coconut Grove than the surrounding parts of the district. It still remains a white district, for a

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 lack of a better term, an Anglo district, right. Those things, you cannot take any of that into
2 account, right?

3 Mr. De Grandy: We sometimes —

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Or can you? That's my question.

5 Mr. De Grandy: — we sometimes take those things into account. And I'll ask Steve also
6 to chime in on it. For example, when we've crafted majority-minority districts in the past where
7 historically there was a lower voter registration, we didn't just look when possible, of course,
8 when the population was there to do it. We didn't just look at doing a 50% or 52%, we looked at
9 doing a 60% because we wanted to factor in that.

10 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: You over compensated for the lack of reporting.

11 Mr. De Grandy: Right, right now we don't have —

12 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: How about with turnout? Can you do that with turnout
13 too? Historical turnout and historical voter participation or registration for that matter.

14 Mr. De Grandy: We could look at those things as long as we stay in deviation.

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah because Commissioner Carollo has a good point.
16 There are districts that no wonder have more registered voters because for many reasons and
17 others that turnout matters too. That combination of things may lead to an underrepresentation.
18 You're right. There is no Anglo or white protected seat, right. But that we have one now because
19 of the over population that exists there. But when you bring it back and you start distributing
20 that, that can very easily change because you don't have to protect that particular class, is not a
21 protected class, right? Whereas, you will have to protect District 5. Is that correct?

22 Mr. De Grandy: I will have to ensure that we do not dilute —

23 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I want to use the word protect, I know you're getting

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 very nervous and so is, Libby, she's not here, but she'll be nervous.

2 Commissioner King: I think what he's trying to say is that you have to, you're going to
3 attempt to try to maintain the core of the existing district.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: The core of the existing district.

5 Mr. De Grandy: And comply with the Voting Rights Act.

6 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: And comply with the Voting Rights Act of '65. Okay.

7 Commissioner Russell: Commissioner Reyes has been very patient.

8 Commissioner Reyes: Yeah, I've been, I've been. Most of the questions that I had have
9 been answered, but when you referred as Commissioner Carollo, he referred to the registered
10 voters. You don't take into consideration race or voters. The law says you take into consideration
11 residents, right? That's residents is the, it is what is taken into consideration. You came here
12 asking for guidance.

13 Mr. De Grandy: Right.

14 Commissioner Reyes: I think that Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla, the way that he
15 stated it, I do agree, we want to protect the integrity of the main core of the, I for one, of the
16 district without, and to assure —

17 Mr. De Grandy: The core of existing districts.

18 Commissioner Reyes: On the core of the district to ensure continuity. You see? I think
19 that is extremely important. Because if we start chopping, having district back and forth, and
20 totally different, I don't think that even the residents are going to feel comfortable with it.

21 Mr. De Grandy: Yeah.

22 Commissioner Reyes: And I want you to take that into consideration and in my case I
23 will strongly request that the districts, you see, would be, remain as they are as possible. You

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 see? Remain as the core of the district, remain as intact as possible. Take that into consideration.

2 That's very important to me. And also at the same time, you see, as Commissioner King said, we
3 have to protect the core of District 5, and as much as we can also, the core of District 2, although
4 there is not a white district anymore, but we will, and I'm going to be very clear on it. This
5 district, I remember the first time that it was, this was drawn, you were mayor, right? You were
6 mayor —

7 Commissioner Carollo: Well —

8 Commissioner Reyes: And it was done, excuse me Commissioner, it was drawn in a way
9 that every single ethnic group would be represented. And that's why this is the odd shape that we
10 have now, you see, for every single district, and it was drawn, what was the name, this guy that
11 drew them, [inaudible], was the one that presented this plan, and I was here, and I didn't agree
12 with it.

13 Commissioner Carollo: No. No.

14 Commissioner Reyes: Yes. Yes. Yes.

15 Commissioner Carollo: That was the first one, there was then, I don't know.

16 Commissioner Reyes: Well when he presented this plan, I was very upset about it
17 because it divide Flagami the way it was, but that's out of this question.

18 Commissioner Carollo: This plan came after. The one you have today was not the
19 original one.

20 Commissioner Reyes: No, no, I'm saying that this plan, it was changed to this plan after
21 10 years, but the original was different. But it was drawn in a way that every single ethnic group
22 was protected. You see?

23 Mr. De Grandy: Yes, but it was done on race neutral criteria. For example, District 2 was

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 justified on the basis of being a coastal district, being a high density district, being an
2 environmentally sensitive district. Steve you had something that you wanted to add.

3 Mr. Cody: No, I wanted, on another subject, but finish your thought.

4 Mr. De Grandy: All right.

5 Commissioner Reyes: And also, one thing that is, I mean, it's also worrisome to District 1
6 and 3 because you have the highest population of non-voters, residents. It is, you have a task in
7 front of you. And I personally will love to preserve the integrity of the core of my district, and I
8 think that you have to start from that.

9 Mr. De Grandy: And Commissioner if I may, as you're giving me your individual
10 guidance, I can, and I think your attorney will tell you, I can only follow guidance that is given to
11 me as a body. And so, if there's three of you that want to maintain the core of existing districts,
12 that's what I do. If there's three of you that want to keep traditional communities together, keep
13 Allapattah, keep Little Havana, keep Wynwood, etcetera, within a district where possible, that's
14 what I do. But as you develop your discussion, please understand I would suggest you make
15 motions as to what criteria you will want to direct me to use, and that's what I'll do.

16 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I think we want both of those things.

17 Commissioner Reyes: That's right.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yes, so I think, and I'll make a motion to that end. I
19 guess for discussion purposes, we can then change it. That we want to maintain the core
20 constituencies of the districts, and we want to maintain traditional communities, as we know
21 them in Miami. Allapattah is Allapattah. Flagami is Flagami. Wynwood is Wynwood. Overtown
22 is Overtown. Those communities need to be protected. What you don't want to do is you don't
23 want to split them. You don't want to cut them in half. You don't want to dilute their voting

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 strength or their ability to elect one of their own.

2 Commissioner Carollo: You have many that have been cut in half, for instance
3 Shenandoah.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah of course, I'm —

5 Commissioner Carollo: Silver Bluff.

6 Commissione Russell: Wynwood.

7 Commissioner Carollo: Wynwood.

8 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: But those are communities that are similar in nature.

9 Commissioner Reyes: Flagami is split in half, Flagami is split.

10 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Flagami is split in half between you and me.

11 Commissioner Carollo: If we could go back to a couple of the pages that you have.

12 Mr. De Grandy: Which ones?

13 Commissioner Carollo: I think there were a couple before this last one that we have here.

14 Mr. De Grandy: Traditional redistricting principles?

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I withdraw the part of traditional communities, and I'll
16 leave the part of only core constituencies. How about that? This is a recommended motion, not to
17 debate it now, just out there.

18 Commissioner Russell: You're making a motion at this point?

19 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I'm making a motion.

20 Commissioner Russell: Is there a second for Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla's motion?

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I'm making a motion just to preserve core
22 constituencies.

23 Commissioner Carollo: That I think we're all in agreement on.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

Commissioner Reyes: I second.

Commissioner Russell: Seconded my Commissioner Reyes. Keep on discussing.

Commissioner Carollo: Can we go back one more?

Mr. De Grandy: One more Steve.

Commissioner Carollo: One more back if we could. One more.

Mr. De Grandy: One more Steve. One more.

Commissioner Carollo: No, no, let's go forward.

Mr. De Grandy: One with the map or text.

Commissioner Carollo: The text.

Mr. De Grandy: Text, okay.

Commissioner Carollo: You can go forward.

Mr. De Grandy: Go forward?

Commissioner Carollo: Okay, hold on a minute Steve. Okay, let's go to the next one.

Okay.

Commissioner Russell: We're drawing, we're drawing it now.

Commissioner Carollo: You can hold on for one second. If not I'm going to get you pampers for the next meeting. This is important. Hold it, you're a big boy. Breathe. Minority voters must be politically cohesive. Okay?

Mr. De Grandy: Yes sir.

Commissioner Carollo: Okay and this to me is one of the most important aspects of what we need to give him instructions on. And I think we all understand why that is important. Minority voters must be politically cohesive. I will make a motion that this will be part of what you use to put the districts together, also. The minority voters must be politically cohesive.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Mr. De Grandy: In other words, what you're saying is over and above the Voting Rights
2 Act analysis, you want me to look at how different neighborhoods and communities vote, and if
3 they vote in a cohesive manner, try to keep them together.

4 Commissioner Carollo: Correct.

5 Mr. De Grandy: Okay.

6 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That will be sort of an amendment, right? Do you
7 mind? Preserve core traditional constituencies and minority voters must be politically cohesive.

8 Commissioner Carollo: Yes those two.

9 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Just those two for now.

10 Commissioner Russell: Who second, and then we can accept the amendment.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Can we pass this one and then continue?

12 Commissioner Carollo: Then you can go and you know.

13 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, let's pass this one. This is an important one.

14 Commissioner Carollo: We won't pass too many.

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Believe me I'm fast, I'm fast.

16 Commissioner Reyes: This is the starting point and he's going to come back and the big
17 argument is going to come when we see the map.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Of course. So I call the question so I can go to the
19 restroom and then I'll be right back, I promise.

20 Commissioner Carollo: And I will suggest he come back with two maps.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Okay, I like that too.

22 Commissioner Carollo: Let me explain to you how.

23 Mr. De Grandy: Because what I will tell you commissioners, and I said it briefly in my

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 presentation, because the prime directives are driven by the numbers, we will not be able to fully
2 satisfy every one of your directions. We just can't. Because for example, voter cohesion, that
3 may tell me, okay, let me break up this traditional neighborhood because this side of the street
4 votes that way, the other the other. Compactness, if you're trying to tell me to be compact. I can't
5 do it on core of existing districts, so I just want to put that on your radar at the end of the day, if I
6 present a plan that nobody's 100% happy, I probably did my job.

7 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: And I'll tell you, nobody is going to like your maps.
8 I've never seen in any redistricting situation where every commissioner, every senator, every
9 representative, has come away liking a map completely, but they're happy that it's fair enough.
10 And that's what we care.

11 Mr. De Grandy: Try to do it —

12 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Your job is to make sure that it's legally correct.

13 Mr. De Grandy: My job is first and foremost that it's constitutionally compliant with the
14 Voting Rights Act and second that it reflects to the greatest extent possible, the direction given
15 by this commission.

16 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: okay.

17 Commissioner King: Also, I think you should take into consideration to try to avoid voter
18 confusion. Because we don't want to disrupt, we don't want our voters not to know who they're
19 voting for because we've changed it so drastically.

20 Commissioner Reyes: Absolutely.

21 Commissioner King: That there's an issue there and I think we should be shooting for
22 substantial equality.

23 Mr. De Grandy: Yes ma'am. If that motion has passed, that will be my direction.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Instead of mathematical, but substantial.

2 Mr. De Grandy: Is that in the form of a motion, ma'am?

3 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's the third part of the motion.

4 Commissioner Russell: It's just an amendment to existing one.

5 Commissioner Carollo: The core of each district, certainly yours. Mine is gonna stay the
6 same because you can't go any other way.

7 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right.

8 Commissioner Carollo: Yours will also, which is Allapattah, that whole area. That won't
9 change. The change that's gonna come basically is from two areas. Russell's district is divided
10 really into three areas: the Grove, Brickell/Downtown.

11 Commissioner Russell: Correct. Edgewater/Morningside.

12 Commissioner Carollo: Then you've got the rest of that.

13 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Edgewater Morningside and all of that area.

14 Commissioner Carollo: Downtown is not going anywhere. Cuz it's right in the middle.

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right.

16 Commissioner Carollo: You could only make changes from the northern part of District 2
17 or from the southern part, down here.

18 Commissioner Russell: There's some western pieces as well.

19 Commissioner Carollo: Yeah but that's across there. Those are gone already. I'm not
20 even throwing those in there.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Just don't give me Wynwood. That's all.

22 Commissioner Carollo: I figured you wanted that. Didn't I tell you that, Mr. De Grandy?
23 When I met with him, I told him, "Commissioner, he has some critiques."

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Or give me a little bit of Wynwood.

2 Commissioner Carollo: Yeah.

3 Mr. De Grandy: Well, if I may, Commissioner, I may be even more constrained than that
4 because the last cycle, I was able to do exactly what you said. I was able to take the north of
5 District 2 and put it into District 5 because it was significantly underpopulated. That did dilute
6 somewhat the Black voting percentage. If I were to try to take 28,000 or even 10 or 15,000 and
7 just lop them into District 5, District 5 may not be a performing district anymore for the minority
8 community. And so I have to look at that under the Voting Rights Act. And so quite frankly, if
9 you look at the map, I have a wall that separates D2 and D5. I could certainly work around the
10 edges of that wall. But really —

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: The southern part.

12 Mr. De Grandy: The southern part of District 2, is what's in play and that needs to ripple
13 up.

14 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right.

15 Mr. De Grandy: Unless you tell me, "Start from scratch."

16 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Well, it's interesting because if that part, the white
17 seats, for lack of a better term, it's not a protected class. You can in fact move some of those
18 people north, into 4, into 3, and then west into 1, from east to west, right, and then 5. So you can
19 move from south, north or the other way around, right, from north, south, and take some of those
20 communities that are white communities and incorporate them into some of the Hispanic seats,
21 for lack of a better term, again, right, without diluting Hispanic minority power in those districts,
22 correct? And you can also go from east to west. For example, I end on 7th Avenue, I-95 more or
23 less, and you could add some of those areas, right? Again, we're not drawing maps now. I'm just

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 saying that in essence you're gonna have to add. I'll give you an example: Douglas Park.
2 Douglas Park is a politically cohesive community that's in Commissioner Russell's district. It
3 probably doesn't belong there. If you look at political cohesion, it probably belongs in
4 Commissioner Reyes' district. That's an example. I think 577 is the number of the precinct,
5 right?

6 Commissioner Carollo: A very big area.

7 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: 577 where Victor's Cafe used to be and all those areas,
8 right? It's 577. I think it is.

9 Commissioner Carollo: Well, he's got Victor's Cafe already.

10 Commissioner Reyes: I got it from 25th.

11 Commissioner Carollo: He's got that already.

12 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, from 25th to US 1.

13 Commissioner Reyes: [Inaudible].

14 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: The point is that that area is more politically cohesive.
15 It has more core constituents than they do — More commonalities I guess than they do with
16 Coconut Grove, as an example, or Edgewater. Things like that can happen, right, as an example,
17 without drawing a map, just using that particular precinct as an example so just for conversation
18 purposes that you can in fact take that and put it into Commissioner Reyes' district, District 4,
19 right?

20 Mr. De Grandy: Yes, sir.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: You can do something like that and US-1 will be your
22 marker, something like that.

23 Mr. De Grandy: Yes, sir.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Right? Okay.

2 Mr. De Grandy: Steve? You had a comment?

3 Mr. Cody: Yeah, just so you know that while we didn't include voter turnout or how the
4 vote result was in the present district because it's not really relevant as to whether there is a
5 violation if we try to use these districts again. We do have the data from the last 10 years for
6 voter registration and voter turnout, voter turnout by ethnicity and also we have the data for all of
7 the statewide races. We don't have countywide races because our software vendor didn't have
8 that but at least we can give you an idea of it again with the Gillum v. DeSantis.

9 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: You don't have countywide numbers because your
10 software vendor didn't give it to you? Get another vendor.

11 Mr. Cody: Well, for instance, to them, the Daniella Levine Cava race v. Steve Bovo, that
12 race isn't available because for them it is not economically feasible to put that into the system.
13 The cost of that to add all of those countywide races for Dade County would probably add about
14 \$100,000 to our cost.

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I don't know where the heck you buy your data from.
16 It's nowhere near that cost.

17 Mr. Cody: It's a company called ESRI.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Find another company because I buy data all the time
19 and it doesn't cost that. Whether your program can correlate all the different data into including
20 those elections I think those elections, I think those elections are important. Let me tell you why
21 they're important.

22 Commissioner Carollo: Extremely important.

23 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Let me tell you why they're extremely important

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 because the people who voted in local elections are not the same people who voted in governor's
2 elections or in presidential elections, different kinds of people, different turnouts.

3 Commissioner Carollo: I'm gonna tell you.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's why it's important.

5 Commissioner Carollo: In my district, there are some precincts that not a single Hispanic
6 or Republican has been able to have won in about a decade except for me. It's a fact so, I'm not
7 the not the norm. I'm the not-normal that I won those precincts.

8 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: We agree with that.

9 Commissioner Carollo: I saw.

10 Commissioner Russell: You're so bipartisan.

11 Commissioner Carollo: Well, I try to not get like you or some others.

12 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, non-partisan words.

13 Commissioner Carollo: I understand that this is a nonpartisan position.

14 Commissioner King: I'd like to chime in as well because this is the second time I heard
15 something about money and the cost, what it would cost, and I wouldn't want you to prepare this
16 based on trying to save money. I think this is important enough and it affects so many lives that
17 the financing of this should not be a consideration. We should spend what we need to spend and
18 we should analyze however we need to analyze, no matter the cost, because this will affect the
19 lives of residents in Miami-Dade County.

20 Commissioner Carollo: Absolutely right. Well said.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's why it shocked me.

22 Commissioner Carollo: Commissioner, well-said.

23 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Absolutely, too, that's why it shocked me that you said

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 that. First of all, it doesn't cost that much but let's say your vendor wants to charge you that
2 much. That data, as Commissioner Carollo also said, local election data is critical. It should not
3 have a price tag attached to it to make this kind of important decision. Who's gonna represent
4 people?

5 Mr. De Grandy: If I can interject, we've been using the same software that's used by the
6 state of Florida. That being the case, you want us to use other software, you want us to add
7 additional data, it's all a matter of cost.

8 Commissioner King: I'm not only speaking about the software because there's a time-
9 sensitive issue. Can you get it done by February 2022? I don't wanna rush it. I don't want to do
10 anything because it's cost-prohibitive. I want us to take our time and I want it to be done
11 correctly so that we achieve the goals that this body has identified to you so that our constituency
12 is well-served into the future. This isn't something that should be rushed. This isn't something
13 that we should use coupons for. We should take our time and we should do it correctly.

14 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Call Miami-Dade Elections and they'll charge you \$40
15 bucks for everybody who voted in that election, [inaudible] last election.

16 Commissioner Reyes: In other words, what Commissioner King is saying is don't
17 constrain yourself because it's gonna cost or don't rush yourself to have this before the deadline
18 because of the additional cost. We wanna do it right. Isn't that right?

19 Mr. De Grandy: Commissioners, I've heard you loud and clear and, again, it's a matter of
20 costs. We will get different software. We will have additional elections. That's not a problem.
21 It's just a matter of I'm gonna have to bill you for it but other than that it's not a problem.

22 Commissioner Carollo: Let me go and I'm glad that you took my advice and you
23 breathed hard. You stay with us. You're okay then.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yeah, I'm good. I have control.

2 Commissioner Carollo: Let me go a little bit real quick into the history of this and
3 Commissioner King was a lot younger than some of us so she won't remember as well as a
4 bunch over here or Mr. Díaz de la Portilla. When we went to districts, we went to districts when I
5 was mayor. We had no African American representation in the commission. So, instead of
6 waiting for more years to go on like that so there could be a solid case made in the court, I
7 decided that I was gonna put in my political capital and make districts to assure that there would
8 be an African American sitting in this commission and there would be an Anglo. We've got half
9 of one now but we're still good. And I wanted to make sure that there were three Hispanic
10 districts because that's the way that our population was and basically it still is. It passed. I knew
11 that there were a lot of negative points from going to districts but there were even greater
12 negativities if we didn't do that. That's why I pushed it and it passed.

13 Now going into where we're at today and what we originally started with is night and day
14 difference with what we have. For instance, Flagami was part of one district and not cut down
15 the middle and I could go on. But what I want to be clear is that while the core of our districts are
16 gonna be kept and the only one that might be affected by that is District 2 because where is the
17 core? But in the other districts, the core will be kept because of the way it's comprised, the
18 districts there. This is one that every district is gonna have to lose some precincts that it has so
19 that what we want to see happen, what was the original idea, back, many years back, would be
20 the reason that we're having districts. To keep an even population. And that minority voters will
21 be politically cohesive within these districts. To be even more clear, I want all my colleagues to
22 understand that there's not a single one of us here that's gonna be able to keep all the sirloin and
23 the gravy will then go to some of the other districts. All of us are gonna have to give and take

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 while keeping the core of our district intact. The hardest one is, because of the way it was made
2 or the reasons it was made, is District 2. That's the one that's got the biggest population and
3 we're gonna have to cut from somewhere. If it's not north, the bulk of it is gonna be south.

4 Commissioner Russell: Well, I'd like to ask some questions that may take us in a
5 different direction and it'll all depend on the will of this body, of course, and potentially even the
6 voters if this has to go as a charter change, depending on how far we go. I think that the first
7 question actually is how far do we want to go?

8 Commissioner Carollo: Well, this is not a charter issue.

9 Commissioner Russell: In your current iteration it is not but let's just throw this out here.
10 Mr. De Grandy, do you know of any city our size that has as few commissioners as we do?

11 Mr. De Grandy: Commissioner, I could tell you off-hand Atlanta has close to 500,000.
12 They have over a dozen council members. Tampa is close in your population. They have 7
13 members. Steve, do you know any, off-hand?

14 Commissioner Russell: I did a little research and this list of cities are all over 400,000:
15 Arlington, Tulsa, Tampa, Minneapolis, Oakland, Virginia Beach, Long Beach, Omaha, Raleigh,
16 Colorado Springs. None of them have less than 7.

17 Commissioner Carollo: For whatever it's worth, I'll say right now I would not be in favor
18 of adding more elected officials.

19 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Me either.

20 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Sure and that dilutes minority voting power. You're
21 probably just trying to discuss or getting to discuss at-large districts and I will not be in favor of
22 that either.

23 Commissioner Russell: Not necessarily.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: It dilutes minority power.

2 Commissioner Carollo: I don't think you've got the votes for that, sir.

3 Commissioner Russell: It may not be and we've never talked about it so I'm just
4 wondering.

5 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: We all know where you're going.

6 Commissioner Russell: Well, you know because I'm not talking about at-large seats.

7 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Well, you're talking about additional seats.

8 Commissioner Reyes: I don't see why we have to add more. Listen, let's be honest. We
9 are five here and sometimes it takes us a little point we discuss about an hour, about 1
10 assignment and 1 seat and imagine that we have 7 or 8 people here. Come on.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Who the heck wants more politicians? Think about
12 that.

13 Commissioner Reyes: Besides that, it's gonna be an additional cost.

14 Commissioner Carollo: Not only that, having more elected officials doesn't make for
15 better government.

16 Commissioner Reyes: Absolutely not.

17 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Of course not.

18 Commissioner Russell: Okay, we tested that theory.

19 Commissioner Carollo: Look what happened to the county.

20 Commissioner Reyes: That is settled. I think that we have a motion. I think we should
21 vote on it and they have their marching orders and then come back because everything that
22 we've been talking about here and all of that, not until we see. Just like people have expressed
23 whenever you call for a meeting without a map production, we need to see how.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I also think that maybe you should come back on
2 December 9th also.

3 Commissioner Reyes: Absolutely.

4 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: We could have more debate about it and then you have
5 a beautiful Christmas doing maps. Then you come back and you have something forward to
6 February but at least I think we need to think about it a little bit more. At least I do and think if I
7 have any other thoughts on how we should move forward and I don't know about it, something
8 like that.

9 Commissioner Carollo: I think you're right. You should think about December 9th.

10 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I'm not there yet in what I wanna recommend.

11 Commissioner Carollo: What I will say for myself is that I'd like to see two plans. One,
12 frankly all of them you keep the core, as we voted upon, but in one, you're gonna try to see how
13 you take more into the remaining districts from District 2. That's the one with the biggest
14 population by far.

15 Mr. De Grandy: I have to do it in both.

16 Commissioner Carollo: On the other one, you're gonna have to do it also but that's where
17 you will have more wiggle room to move existing precincts around without affecting the core of
18 the district or affecting the least amount to make it a legally-sound plan.

19 Mr. De Grandy: Commissioner, I will try my best to follow that direction but I think
20 moving 28,000 people, there is gonna be disruption in all the districts. I could do one that's
21 maybe less disruption but there will be.

22 Commissioner Carollo: You know what, Miguel? What I'm not going to vote to see is
23 that you're going to create in Hispanic districts, a non-minority, politically cohesive district,

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 where on the surface, it looks like one thing but because the minorities in those districts are not
2 registered to vote because they're not citizens or what have you and because maybe there's a few
3 that think that they are descendants of George Washington and Jefferson, might look at things
4 differently. Then it affects the future of these districts. Now I'm term-limited after these four
5 years so that's just got elected for four so it's not gonna affect me but I've given a lot of my life
6 to this city and I wanna make sure that what I leave behind is gonna protect this city the most
7 that I can. Just like when I made the decision that I was gonna put my neck in this line and that I
8 was gonna push for districts so that we will have African American representation and Anglo
9 representation.

10 Mr. De Grandy: What I will say there, Commissioner, is as we are developing the
11 districts we will certainly. I hear your concern, especially because yours has a low registered-
12 voter percentage. We will be looking at registered voters by ethnicity as a sub analysis as we're
13 crafting the districts to make sure that we address your concern.

14 Commissioner Carollo: Election results.

15 Mr. De Grandy: Of course.

16 Commissioner Carollo: Election results including local elections.

17 Mr. De Grandy: Sure.

18 Commissioner Reyes: Then everything is clear.

19 Commissioner Russell: Got it. There's a motion. There's a second. There are several
20 amendments. Have they been captured?

21 Mr. De Grandy: Let me make sure I understand the amendments: maintain the core of
22 existing districts, address voter cohesion, ensure —

23 Commissioner Carollo: Political cohesiveness.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Mr. De Grandy: Excuse?

2 Commissioner Carollo: Politically cohesive.

3 Mr. De Grandy: Voter cohesion, political cohesion, those are the two I have. Any more?

4 Commissioner King: Substantial equality.

5 Mr. De Grandy: Substantial equality as opposed to mathematics.

6 Commissioner Carollo: Substantial equality, not mathematics.

7 Mr. De Grandy: Got that one. Is there an interest in maintaining traditional districts
8 together and traditional neighborhoods together when feasible?

9 Commissioner King: Yes.

10 Commissioner Reyes: Yes, when feasible.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: When feasible

12 Commissioner Carollo: You already have numerous breaks in my district, with
13 Commissioner Reyes's district. We've got two that have been broken up.

14 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Flagami is also with Commissioner Reyes so those
15 communities can belong in either district, I think, because the core constituency will elect the
16 same kind of representative, right? What you don't wanna break up is you don't wanna break up
17 an Overtown or a Liberty City and put half of Overtown into my district for example.

18 Commissioner Carollo: Exactly.

19 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's what you want to avoid.

20 Mr. De Grandy: I think I'd violate the Voting Rights Act if I did. I'm not going there.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yes, exactly, or increasing in Overtown or whatever.

22 Commissioner Carollo: What I'm saying is we have to also be careful, you see? There is
23 a distinction between ethnicity within a neighborhood.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Well, look, people in the Roads don't vote the same
2 way as people in Allapattah. Even though they may be Cuban American or Hispanic, they don't
3 vote the same way, right? Some of them are, I think you used the term once so I'm not gonna use
4 it, but uppity. Some of them are uppity something. Do you remember that term?

5 Commissioner Carollo: Yes.

6 Mr. De Grandy: I think I referenced that in a legislative debate, yes, many years ago.

7 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yes, uppity something, that one, and some are those
8 kinda people and then they're different so even within racial groups or ethnic groups, there are
9 differences, economic difference, they vote differently.

10 Mr. De Grandy: Of course.

11 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's why election results matter, especially local
12 election results.

13 Commissioner Carollo: That's what you thought of our former city manager that he was
14 uppity?

15 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yes, sorry.

16 Mr. De Grandy: If I may get it, I'm sorry to interrupt you.

17 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Nah, I'm just trying to. You have the motion. The idea
18 is just that you're Cuban American so you understand that within our own community, Hispanic
19 American, within our own community, we have differences also.

20 Mr. De Grandy: Of course.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: There are economic differences.

22 Mr. De Grandy: As in the Black community, with Jamaicans, Haitians.

23 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: As in the Black community, with all communities,

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 there are differences, right?

2 Mr. De Grandy: Yeah.

3 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: You have Haitian Americans versus African
4 Americans so you have those differences too so all those things are factors. They're not just all
5 African American.

6 Commissioner Carollo: The other area that I would like to give them instructions on is
7 that we get at least two potential maps, even a third wouldn't be bad, if you can, and that one of
8 them would be all non-holds-bar in each district where the one you're gonna make the most
9 changes in each district without affecting the core so that we could have, at the very minimum,
10 two to look at, preferably three potential scenarios.

11 Mr. De Grandy: Okay.

12 Commissioner Russell: One with seven districts.

13 Commissioner Carollo: Excuse me?

14 Commissioner King: No.

15 Commissioner Carollo: Nope.

16 Commissioner Russell: No?

17 Commissioner Carollo: Nope.

18 Mr. De Grandy: No.

19 Commissioner Carollo: That's a no-go.

20 Mr. De Grandy: Before you pass on the motion, what I would ask you is now hierarchy.
21 In other words, let me give you suggestions. Substantial equality, that's at the top. That's very
22 important so I have flexibility. From that, do you want the core of the existing district next? Do
23 you want voter cohesion next? Do you want traditional neighborhoods next? Give me.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Reyes: Core.

2 Mr. De Grandy: Core is next?

3 Commissioner Carollo: Core is one. Secondly should be political cohesiveness.

4 Mr. De Grandy: Core and after core, political cohesion?

5 Commissioner Carollo: Yeah.

6 Mr. De Grandy: Got it and then traditional neighborhoods where feasible. Got it.

7 Commissioner Reyes: Where feasible.

8 Mr. De Grandy: Is there a consensus on that? I see it.

9 Commissioner Russell: There is.

10 Commissioner Carollo: There is.

11 Mr. De Grandy: There is, yeah? Okay.

12 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: One more thing that I missed here, you all come back
13 on December 9th and we may have additional direction of where we wanna go because I have
14 more time at least from my perspective. I have more time to think about additional things that we
15 need to do. I know we've been trying to get together. I haven't had the opportunity to meet with
16 you. We've had to cancel a couple of times. I have to cancel and I apologize for that.

17 Commissioner Russell: No problem.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: We need to do it soon before December 9th so we can
19 walk through it and you can give me some ideas.

20 Commissioner Russell: Whenever you want.

21 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I know that we can give you whatever direction we
22 want but you also have the challenge, both of you, of making it legally constitutionally
23 compliant.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Mr. De Grandy: That is the prime directive.

2 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's Number 1 so I don't think we should push you
3 too hard to go outside those parameters.

4 Mr. De Grandy: I can't.

5 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: I know you can't. That's why when you come back to
6 us you may come back to us with an argument unless we have more conversations, December
7 9th, for example, on how far you can go and still defend it in a courtroom. That's kinda the
8 thinking so let me give that some thought from my perspective. That's the only thing I ask.

9 Mr. De Grandy: What we will do from now to then also based on this commission's
10 direction is we will look at loading the local elections, if necessary, looking at different software
11 but please understand that I will send you a bill for that.

12 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Yes, sir. Make it a small bill.

13 Commissioner Russell: Of course. We're gonna be checking it for [inaudible]. All right,
14 we have a motion. We have a second. Is there anyone here who would like to speak on this at
15 public comment? Please address. Please come to the lectern. You have two minutes. Let us know
16 your name and then right after public comment we're gonna break 'til 7. Please don't load up on
17 tryptophan in Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla's office. We still have a night ahead of us. Not
18 too much turkey. If they ate too much turkey, they're gonna sleep. You're recognized.

19 Hector Silva: Thank you. My name is Hector Silva. I am in District 2. A few things with
20 respect to the cost: I understand that you guys are gonna present them a bill. As a city resident,
21 not that I'm opposed to it because I do fully agree with Commissioner King's comments that the
22 cost really shouldn't be the barrier here and that notwithstanding it seems to me that some idea of
23 cost should be presented prior to the costs having been incurred but that's just me. Just that. The

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 other thing is with respect to the idea of a charter change, I understand, well, I see a very clear
2 visceral resistance which I can understand and I will say this with respect so please don't take it
3 in a certain way but as a constituent what I hear is the notion of politicians wanting to stick to
4 power and not seeing their power somehow being diluted. I understand that there can be other
5 arguments in favor of your positions and I could just say that there is a world where it is possible
6 that the items to which you stated commitment most specifically that minority voting blocs not
7 be diluted, a commitment which I also hold, there is a world where it's possible to have that and
8 at the same time still have more seats in a commission. If you're looking at Hispanic groups for
9 instance, there are more seats there. In the case of a group like District 2 that has such a high
10 population that that be broken up. Trust me, as a member of District 2, I live in Edgewater. I sort
11 of like the idea that we have power, right, because we have it with the high-earning committee or
12 communities of the coast, et cetera. It's nice to know that we're that kind of powerful voting
13 bloc. At the same time, I could see a world where it's justifiable that Edgewater and downtown
14 or the CBD be one thing, that Brickell and perhaps the roads be another thing or that it be
15 Brickell without the roads and it be Brickell and the CBD. Then Edgewater all the way up
16 through Morningside or whatever it is. I happen to like my district the way that it is and I also
17 believe that for the future of the city that we need to consider other possibilities besides what you
18 also have at the moment with the 5 seats, particularly given the fact that we're literally the outlier
19 in terms of the number of commission seats for a city of this his population. I do say that with all
20 respect.

21 Commissioner Russell: Thank you for your comments. I couldn't have said it better.

22 Commissioner Carollo: If I could say this with all due respect, first of all, I think you're
23 somewhat wrong in your personal assessment that politicians wanna stay and keep their power.

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 I'm term limited. I have four more years. He's term limited, I think a couple more years. Your
2 first thesis is somewhat incorrect.

3 Hector Silva: May I respond to that?

4 Commissioner Carollo: Sure, absolutely, sir. You could, please.

5 Hector Silva: Thank you. I hear you and I can see in the case of you personally and
6 perhaps the other commissioners that are term limited. Besides that to play devil's advocate that
7 doesn't mean that people in power currently aren't going to have some sort of influence over
8 people in power subsequently and that the idea that districts remain similar is important to them
9 because the power can be transferred, even if informally, Number 1.

10 Commissioner Carollo: Believe me, that's very difficult.

11 Hector Silva: I don't think it's that difficult given the current political situation that we're
12 in with our president but, besides that, I don't mean to be disrespectful.

13 Commissioner Carollo: Not at all, sir.

14 Hector Silva: I do see that it's not necessarily about you personally and I'm not talking
15 about you personally or making it a personal attack.

16 Commissioner Carollo: I didn't take it that way.

17 Hector Silva: What I'm saying is that in terms of the future of a city it just seems to me
18 that we can be more in line with systems that we know work in other cities. There's quite a bit of
19 dysfunction in the city of Miami, as all of you know, and I know and we all know, and it's just
20 one way that things could be looked at.

21 Commissioner Carollo: There is where I have a major disagreement with you. To begin
22 with, I could with no disrespect, like you said before, turn the shoe the other way. The reason
23 maybe you might want more districts is because maybe you want some of that power that you

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 claim some up here want to hold onto by being able to have more seats that you could run for
2 office. When you say that we're dysfunctional and other cities, what other cities are you
3 comparing us to? I'm curious.

4 Hector Silva: Mr. Russell ran through a list of many cities as well as the attorneys that
5 you guys have hired to run through this program.

6 Commissioner Carollo: I know but you were saying the other cities. Which are those
7 cities then?

8 Hector Silva: Atlanta was on that list. Tampa was on the list.

9 Commissioner Carollo: No, no, not as far as dysfunctional.

10 Hector Silva: I didn't comment on the dysfunction of other cities. I commented on the
11 dysfunction of the city of Miami.

12 Commissioner Carollo: Right, but you're comparing it to other cities that are not
13 apparently and that's why I wanted to know which cities do you think are working well
14 comparing to us not working well?

15 Hector Silva: To be frank, I grew up in Orlando and I think Orlando, from a city
16 perspective, functions in a much more efficient way than the city of Miami. The population is
17 different here. There's more but yeah.

18 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: That's why they're all moving to Orlando, right, not to
19 Miami?

20 Hector Silva: No, I definitely love Miami. I wanna be here.

21 Commissioner Russell: Commissioners, we have a long wait ahead of us. Let's not
22 debate our residents.

23 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Is that why everybody's coming here?

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 Commissioner Russell: Let's move on.

2 Commissioner Díaz de la Portilla: Is that why everybody's coming here?

3 Commissioner Carollo: No, you answered my question and what I've been concerned
4 about and that's a fairly large group of transplants, like yourself, that have moved here in the past
5 years.

6 Hector Silva: 12 to be exact.

7 Commissioner Carollo: Well, 12 is a respectable amount of time. It is still by many
8 considered to be fairly new in a city like Miami, even though it's a new city.

9 Hector Silva: Absolutely, I agree.

10 Commissioner Carollo: I thank you for your comments and no disrespect.

11 Hector Silva: I got that and I do actually love that you guys are here and have been here
12 for a long time. As far as the city of Miami, I love this city and I wouldn't live anywhere else if it
13 were in the United States and I think in that regard we just share the same goal to make Miami a
14 better city for the future.

15 Commissioner Carollo: Good, well, I'm glad you like your cities. You see? For you to
16 like it, it must mean that we're doing something right.

17 Hector Silva: I never said you didn't do anything right but all things that are good can be
18 improved. Thank you very much.

19 Commissioner Carollo: That's true. That is true.

20 Commissioner Russell: Thank you for your comments. Is there anyone else who'd like to
21 speak and public comment on the item? You're very welcome, 2 minutes, and let's not debate
22 our residents. Let's get this out. Let's get this done.

23 Julie Marge Betty Gorge: My name Julie Marge Betty Gorge. I'm actually from District

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

12. I believe you used to be our manager in Doral or our city manager in Doral. It's been quite a few years, about 15.

Commissioner Carollo: I was city manager in Doral but what district is that?

Julie Marge Betty Gorge: It was District 12.

Commissioner Carollo: Okay this was a county commission.

Julie Marge Betty Gorge: Yeah, a county, yes.

Commissioner Carollo: A county commission, yes. We don't reach Doral.

Julie Marge Betty Gorge: Understood. I just happened to be in the area and I'm getting back to being active within the patriot politics of Miami.

Commissioner Carollo: You still live in Doral?

Julie Marge Betty Gorge: I do. At the time, I'm currently homeless but that's neither here nor there. My question is and maybe it's the autism in me, earlier he mentioned that we were talking about the minorities under the Voting Rights Act but that now it seems like the Anglos are the minority. Am I missing something in this? I know it can go layers and layers.

Commissioner Russell: They're not a protected minority.

Julie Marge Betty Gorge: Am I missing the detail in that, that the Anglos are now the de facto minority?

Mr. De Grandy: May I respond?

Commissioner Russell: Mr. De Grandy would be the perfect person to respond.

Mr. De Grandy: Yes, what I stated was from a factual perspective, the Voting Rights Act protects language and racial minorities and the terminology is protected class. White Anglo is not a protected class under the Voting Rights Act. That does not mean that under the 14th Amendment they may not have rights but under the specific statute, the Voting Rights Act, they

Transcript 1 - Miami City Commission - Nov. 18, 2021 - Afternoon Session

1 are not a protected class.

2 Julie Marge Betty Gorge: We are still in the division of white versus Black in that
3 category where Anglos are no de facto minorities but if we want to change anything, we would
4 have to go through the process of modifying it at a higher level.

5 Mr. De Grandy: That is correct. All I'm saying is what the law is, not what the law
6 should be.

7 Julie Marge Betty Gorge: Correct, thank you very much. I appreciate it.

8 Commissioner Russell: Thank you for your comments. All right, is there anyone else here
9 who'd like to speak in public comment? Seeing none, I'll close public comment. Any further
10 discussion on the dais? All in favor say, "Aye."

11 All Commissioners: Aye.

12 Commissioner Russell: Any opposed? Motion passes. We'll break for 15 minutes and
13 come back and handle the Magnolia issue next.



Van Online Services, Inc.

Think Service Think Van


Certificate of Transcription

**Transcription of “Commission Meeting-Afternoon Session-
November 18 2021.mp4”**

We, Van Online Services, Inc. a professional Transcription company, hereby certify that the above-mentioned File(s) has/have been Transcribed by our qualified and experienced Transcriber(s) is/are accurate and true Transcription of the original File(s).

This is to certify the correctness of the Transcription only. We cannot guarantee the veracity of the original File. Our Transcriber is in no way related, by immediate family ties or marriage, to any parties related to the materials Transcribed.

A copy of the Transcription is attached to this certification.


Crystal Nichols, Production Manager.



Dated: 24th day of October 2022

Van Online Services, Inc.
ATA Member #266532
ISO 9001:2015

**Central Park Corporate Center, 1320 Central Park Blvd. Suite 200,
Fredericksburg VA 22401
Office: (888) 535-5668
Email: support@vananservices.com
Website: www.vananservices.com**